



WWJMRD 2024; 10(07): 69-73

www.wwjmr.com

International Journal

Peer Reviewed Journal

Refereed Journal

Indexed Journal

Impact Factor SJIF 2017:

5.182 2018: 5.51, (ISI) 2020-

2021: 1.361

E-ISSN: 2454-6615

Lalrinpuii

Lsc 1913

IGNOU IASE

Lallianzuali Fanai

Institute of Advanced Studies

in Education

A Comparative Study of Class Xi Geography Textbook Prescribed by NCERT and MBSE

Lalrinpuii, Lallianzuali Fanai

Abstract

The main purpose of the study is to compare two boards National Council for Educational research and Training (NCERT) and Mizoram Board of School Education (MBSE) class XI Geography Textbook. The comparison indicates the general information of both the textbook, the content, heading, sub heading, sub unit, presentation, illustration, language, nature of questions and activities. The study textbook of NCERT consists of three textbook Fundamental of Physical Geography, India: Physical Environment and The Practical work. MBSE have one single textbook but the textbook is classified into part three; Part A – Fundamental of Physical Geography, Part B- India: Physical Environment and Part C- Practical work. Both the study textbook is relevant for learners who studied class XI and matched age-appropriate class and meet the desire curriculum. Though the nature of textbook is slightly different the syllabus of both the board in terms of content is same. As NCERT is National level and MBSE is State level, their prescribed textbook published is quite enough for class XI students for getting information of Geographical knowledge and development

Keywords: NCERT, MBSE, Geography, Textbooks.

Introduction

Rationale of the study: Comparing two board textbook is essential for learning development. The two study textbooks NCERT AND MBSE are different in nature, the former stand for national level and the latter stand for State level. Comparing textbook is important to ensure that students are provided with the best possible educational materials, so they can be adequately prepared for the future. The importance of textbook compare is to determine whether a textbook will be useful or effective for students. It is also an important part in education and learners as it helps to ensure the material presented in textbooks is accurate, up-to- date, and appropriate for the intended audience. It also helps to identify any areas of content be the same or should be expanded upon.

Comparing the textbook plays a crucial role in ensuring that students have access to high quality learning materials that align with their academic goals and support their educational progress. A thorough comparison process helps educators and curriculum designers make informed decisions about which textbook are appropriate for their students. By carefully assessing the content, structure, pedagogical approach, and overall quality of textbook, educators can identify resource that effectively engage students, foster critical thinking, and provides a solid foundation for academic achievement. Ryu, Jeon and Paik (2021) Textbook description requires improvement so that ignorance of teacher towards concept is reduced.

Comparison of textbook is important for both learners and teachers because this determine whether a textbook will be useful for effective for use for class. Textbook compare enhances before teaching to realize focus, characteristics, features and importance given to develop skills, knowledge and attitude among learners. Bhenke (2014) design quality of textbook is an important factor for Geography learning. Textbook need to be relevant from the point of view of students to become importance source of Geography learning and more effective as autonomous study resources.

Correspondence:

Lalrinpuii

Lsc 1913

IGNOU IASE

Review of Literature

Kar Biswajit & Prof. Dr. Anand Moy (2003) - CBSE vs State board which is better can be concluded by understanding the learning methods, syllabus, grading system, entrance exam and more. The students can use these differences to know which board to choose and pursue their schooling. Every board is focused on a different syllabus. CBSE board is more focused on subjects like science and maths. Whereas state board gives more emphasis on regional language, local topics and state level- matter also. The CBSE board is considered easier to understand as compare to the state board syllabus. The syllabus of CBSE also includes the exercise question and practice questions that help students to evaluate their knowledge about the topic. The syllabus of CBSE will help students in future exams as well.

Dr. Pradip Sarkar & Santanu Naskar (2020)- A history has a unique position in an educational program. It has a close relationship between the persons and agencies involved in the education of a learner (Aggarwal, p.196). This paper explores comparison the history textbook for STD X of West Bengal Board of Secondary education (WBBSE) and Central Board of Secondary Education (CBSE). This study is interested to evaluate the history textbook of WBBSE and CBSE. Evaluation is done with respect to five bases. The study also revealed that in the WBBSE History book provides the background of freedom movement, national hero and herion and the involvement of public in the movement. In CBSE history textbook the freedom movement has been cenimous with the leadership of Gandhi between two national chausses. CBSE has a smaller number of pages in comparison that of WBBSE.

Ronghuai Huang, Ahmed Tilli, Xiangling Zhang and Tiayue Sun (2022)- Textbook are essential components in the learning process. They assist in achieving educational learning outcomes and developing social and cultural value. However, limited studies provide comprehensive frameworks for comparing textbooks. Most have focused on a specific textbook perspective within a particular discipline. Therefore, this study used a triangulation method to develop a comprehensive framework for textbook comparison. Through a systematic literature review and a two round Fuzzy Delphi method with 155 textbook experts, a textbook comparison framework with four indicators (structure, content, expectations and language) was developed. Additionally, some of the developed framework indicators and sub-indicators could be relevant for comparing textbooks in a particular discipline. For example, the page count sub indicator was proven to be useful for comparing humanities and social science textbooks but not natural science textbooks. The findings of this study could facilitate the process of comparing textbooks, hence promoting the understanding of knowledge design and acquisition in different contexts, such as when comparing textbooks from different countries.

Objectives

1. To identify the general information about the two-board textbook.
2. To compare the different in contents, subunits' components of geography in both the boards
3. To compare regarding mode of presentation, lanuage, diagram interaction in the class XI Geography textbook in both the boards.
4. To examine the relevance of prescribed Question and

activities in the class XI Geography textbook in both the boards.

Delimitation of the study: To delimit this study we confined to

Content: Physical geography and Geography of India. These two are important for to understand the content of Geography and Indian sub-continent.

Class-Eleven Standard

Board-NCERT and MBSE

Methodology and Procedures

Methodology: The main purpose of the study is to compare the Geography Textbook of class XI prescribed by NCERT and MBSE. The present study used Descriptive Research of Qualitative method of research with book data instruments as data source.

Sample of the study: The researcher selects NCERT and MBSE Geography textbook of class XI as the sample of the study.

Tools and Techniques: With a view to achieve of objectives as stated earlier class XI Geography of the two board is used as a tools and techniques for the study.

Method of Data Collection: The data is collected from the primary source i.e NCERT Geography textbook, Fundamental of Physical Geography, India: Physical Enviroment and MBSE textbook of Geography class XI (taking part A&B only). Data are collected from the general information of the two board textbooks including contents, headlines, sub headlines, activities, questions, map and presentation, etc.

Procedure of Data Analysis: Qualitative data analysis procedure is followed for the present research work.

Introduction: NCERT is an autonomous organisation of Ministry of Education, the Govt. of India, established in 1961. NCERT is a government organisation that has been set up to assist in the qualitative improvement of School education in India. With the aim of building a common education system, the NCERT owns the responsibility of developing and publishing NCERT textbooks. It also develops educational kits and multimedia digital materials to help students with their studies.

CBSE and many State boards are now following the NCERT official textbook for classes 1 to 12 in their school course curriculum. Not only this but for various competitive examination, like IIT, NEET, UPSE, etc. This is because the content in the textbook is developed in a simple and easily understandable way. One can start from basics and can go to a higher level by studying through these books.

Textbook published by NCERT are prescribed by the Central Board of Secondary Education (CBSE) from classes 1 to XII with exception for a few subjects, especially for the class 10 and 12 Board Examination. Around 19 school boards from 14 States have adopted the books. Those who wish to adopt the textbooks are required to send a request to NCERT, upon which soft copies of the books are received. The material is press- read and may be printed by paying a 5% royalty and by acknowledge NCERT.

Mizoram Board of School Education (MBSE) is an autonomous government body for academic administration in Mizoram, India, having its jurisdiction from elementary to higher secondary education. It was established by the Government of Mizoram (then the Union Territoty of India) in 1975 by the Mizoram Board of School Education Act. It

has the power to regulate, supervise and control school education in Mizoram. Its primary function is to prepare academic programmes and organise examination, especially for State Level High School Leaving Certificate (HSLC) and Higher Secondary School Leaving Certificate (HSSLC). MBSE conducts its academic function from class 1 to class 12 in every school of Mizoram, which comes under Mizoram. The NCERT textbooks are preferred to cover all

the syllabus as they are completely in accordance to MBSE curriculum and most of the question are prepared in exam using this textbook. MBSE is responsible to upgrade the syllabus in coordination with the State Govt.

Procedures and Analysis

Identification of General Information of class XI Geography Textbook of NCERT and MBSE-

The following are the general information about NCERT and MBSE Geography class XI Textbooks.

SL	General Information	NCERT- I	NCERT -II	MBSE
1	Name of the book	Fundamental of Physical Geography	India:Physical Environment	Textbook of Geography
2	Publication	Publication division by Secretary NCERT,N.Delhi	Same	Arya Publication
3	Date of publication	Dec,2014	Dec,2014	2010
4	Units in the textbook	6	4	10
5	Number of pages	144	100	325
6	Number of pictures	53	30	110
7	Number of activities	17	7	8
8	Number of exercises	6	4	10
9	Lesson per unit	Various	Various	Various
10	Number of maps	9	24	67
11	Questions	MCQ,SAQ,ETQ	MCQ,SAQ,ETQ	VSAT,SAT,ETQ
12	Selected units	Follow proper sequence	Follow proper sequence	Followproper sequence

While identifying the general information of NCERT and MBSE Geography class XI textbook, the two-board textbook are slightly different as compare to each other. NCERT book consists of two textbook naming Fundamental of Physical Geography and India; Physical Environment while MBSE have one single textbook naming Textbook of Geography comprising part A and B.

The researcher classified the general information of the textbook into two aspects for analysing , one is physical or external features and the other one is internal features.

Difference in contents, sub units/ components of the textbook of Geography in both the boards.

The contents of the two boards textbook are as follow-

UNIT	NCERT I	NCERT II	MBSE
1	Geography as Discipline	Introduction	Geography as Discipline
2	The Earth	Physiography	The Earth
3	Landforms	Climate,Vegetation and Soil	Landforms
4	Climates	Natural Hazards and Disaster	Climates
5	Water		Water
6	Life on the Earth		Life on the Earth
7			Map Work
8			Introduction
9			Physiography
10			Climate,Vegetation and SoilNatural Hazards and Disasters: Causes and Consequences

After the presentation of the content of the two board Geography Textbook the syllabus of the content are the same. Both the board textbook used first letter of each word is in capital letters. They both deals in the Physical Geography and Geography of India in different mode of

textbook. The former deals in two separate textbok and the latter deals in one single textbook. Both the textbook have their own unique characteristics including the size,arrangement, words, colours, style and structure

Headlines and Sub Headlines

List of headlines and sub-Headlines are the following.

Sl. NO	General Information	NCERT	MBSE
1	Size	Bold	Bold
2	Words		
3	Colours	Black and white	Black and white
4	Style	Arabic	Arabic
5	Structure	Small cluster sentence	Small cluster sentence

Both the textbook under headlines, sub headlines and sub unit are same characteristic. For example in NCERT textbook Chapter two 'Structure and Physiography (pages 8 to 9) has bold sub headlines i.e the Peninsular Block, The Himalayas and other Peninsular mountain, Indo Ganga Brahmaputra plain. This type of format is also seen in MBSE textbook giving in Unit IV of Climate (82 & 83 pages) there are bold sub headlines like water vapour, dust particles, structure of atmosphere.

In NCERT, each chapter title letter is capital letter with bold words. For example, Chapter 5 (57 page) NATURAL VEGETATION. While in MBSE chapter title letter is first letter capital letter only. For example, Chapter 2 (PA-12 pages) 'Origin of the Earth'.

To compare mode of presentation, language, diagram interaction in the class XI Geography textbook in both the boards-

Both the study textbook of NCERT and MBSE are entirely fulfilled by many black and white related pictures. Pictures are not only ornament of the textbook. It is placed in accordance with the units and it helps the student for their learning development. Each chapter in both the textbooks have adequate pictures which support the topic to be learned for clear understanding along with the concept of the topic. The language used in both the study textbooks is English. They both present the matter in a very simple language and lucid style. It is favorable both with the teacher as well as the students. The vocabulary used is according to the level of the learners. The language used is grammatically correct. The sentences are short and simple. The researcher finds that no difficult words are not used and the technical terms are used appropriately.

The illustration is given in both the textbook when needed in each chapter. The illustration is simple, evident and logical. Abstract concept of the book is clarified with the help of pictures, diagrams and maps. All illustrations are relevant, applicable and appropriate. It develops the interest and motivate to the learners. The illustrations are well distributed throughout both the study textbook.

Basic illustration are revealed here as the example of pictures, maps uses-

- (1) In page 34-36, NCERT textbook Fundamental of Physical Geography and page A-36-37 page of MBSE, under Plate Tectonics diagrammatic presentation of different types of plate margins and plate boundaries are displayed. This section reveals and motivates the learners to read and understand the concept of Plate Tectonics. NCERT and MBSE put this lesson in (lesson V MBSE and chapter 4 NCERT). This section emphasizes how continents are formed and how the present shape and location of the continents are evolved. This section helps students a clear understanding of continents and its formation. Getting knowledge of plate margin and boundaries impart earthquakes zones of the world. This section explains plate tectonics and the learners get information about the science behind the continents formation from its origin to till date.
- (2) In page B-5 MBSE and page no. 3 NCERT of the study textbooks there are two maps showing India political map. In a political map, it shows States, cities, towns, major highways and byways and major water structures. This section indicates the ability to understand India including its States and Union Territories, its location, latitudes and longitudinal extend, its neighbouring states

and international border, etc. for the learners. Both the study textbooks give a clear picture of related topics which help students for locating places, well understanding and visual interpretation.

To examine the relevance of prescribe Question and Activities in the class XI Geography Textbook in both the boards-

The study textbooks of NCERT and MBSE Geography XI have chapter end exercise and display different type of questions. Getting from general information NCERT have MCQ, SAQ and ETQ, both SAQ and ETQ mention word limit which is 30 words and 150 words. In MBSE P-I does not mention any words limit and the nature of questions are VSA, SAQ and ETQ. MBSE P-II India: Physical Environment have the same nature of question but here it mention word limit 120 words and 150 words. From this it is found that NCERT have a variety of question pattern than MBSE.

For example, MBSE P-II-chapter 8 Natural Hazard and Disaster, question involves are VSAQ (30 maximum word limit), SAQ (word limit 80 words), ETQ (word limit 150 words). In NCERT UNIT IV, Natural Hazard and Disaster causes, consequences and management, the nature of question includes MCQ, SAQ (30 word limit) and ETQ (125 word limits).

Apart from question and answer exercise, activities/project is put in both the textbook. In NCERT it is found that all chapter have project/activities for students. For example NCERT chapter 5 (p-44) there is a project work for students like collect different rocks sample and try to recogniseetc. In MBSE P-I chapter 6 Rocks and Minerals, no project activities is not mentioned there.

It is found out that all the chapter in NCERT have project/activities for students while in MBSE only P-II does project/activities.

The Geography Textbook for class XI of MBSE does not suggest any activity inside the textbook and does not mention any important terms and concept but in NCERT textbook suggested many activities and mention important terms and concept at the right-hand side of the page (NCERT P-45 & 77)

The chapter with associated activities is only some of the channel through which the learners' talents may find manifestation. The activities are graded from simple to complex. The activities are intended for testing textual comprehension as well as multiple manifestation of knowledge in textual information, grammatical and vocabulary skill.

Recommendation

- Both the study textbook should have an appropriate and definite example which enables the learner to incorporate their learning experience and engaging the real world.
- As Geography has different technical terms and concept, it is suggested both the boards should have more factual and specific incident relating to the concept for clear understanding of the subject. Especially, MBSE because it is a state board and the board should include local incident and event which is related to the topic concern.
- Student involve is necessary for every learning so that MBSE should have engage more activities/project for the learners not only chapter end exercise but also activities to be done while teaching in the classroom.

- MBSE should incorporate more information, facts, incident relating to the topics inside the textbook.
- For both the boards, more understanding level of question should be engage because factual and memory-based question does not evaluate the ability of the learners. Learners should develop constructive ideas based on what they learn and this will help in their learning.
- For both the board illustration given in the textbook should be colour. Only black and white colour are used in every illustration. Colour print is advised because it is attractive to the learners. Only the cover page is colour print. Visual attraction is important for learning to catch the attention of learners, illustration should be colour print.
- The data of both the board should be up to date or relevant. It should be the latest version published by Govt. of India or State published.

9. Behnke, Y. 2014. Visual qualities of Future Geography Textbook European Journal of Geography. 5 (4): 56-66.

Conclusion

The study of two boards NCERT and MBSE mark significance research in education. The purpose of this study lies that the difference between these two boards in terms of their general information, activities, language, presentation and project, etc engaged inside the textbooks. Though the study textbooks is prescribed by two different boards the syllabus of the contents and aim of learning outcome is same in manner. Therefore, the study concludes that the content, activities and chapter end exercise are so relevant. By completing this study and from the findings of the study it has been clear that the present textbooks must need revision and modernization. MBSE should take the immediate and urgent steps for further revision because the board prescribes textbook is fully adopted from CBSE. In case of revision, modernization and renewal of textbook should be done with respect of recommendations, guidelines of latest NCF 2020 as well as context of students and society of Mizoram with keeping the objectives of teaching Geography according to NCF 2020 in mind.

References

1. S.Pradip & N. Satanu, (2020), A Comparative study of History Textbook of Class X between WBBSE and CBSE, Howrah, West Bengal.
2. NCERT <https://ncert>.
3. Mizoram Board of School Education, <https://www.mbse.edu.in>
4. NCERT, BYJU'S, <https://www.mbse.com>
5. Geography Education, IJG.2022. Analysis of Geography textbook activities in the context of units and critical thinking skills. From <https://dergiperk.org.igge>.
6. K.Biswaji & Prof. Dr. M. Anand, 2023. Comparing the Educational Systems of Central Board of Secondary Education (CBSE) and West Bengal Board of Secondary Education (WBBSE), Purba Bardhaman District of West Bengal.
7. H.Ronghuai, T.Ahmed, Z.Xiangling and S.Tianyue, 2022. A Comprehensive Framework for Comparing Textbooks: Insights from the literature and Experts. <https://www.researchgate.net>.
8. Ryu, E.J.; Jeon, E.S.; Paik, S.H. Analysis of textbook of Textbook of Chemistry I, II, and survey of Chemistry Education Major Pre Service Teacher Perception, 2021, 65, 358-369 (Google Scholar)